# "My Agenda": Your Personal Agenda

## 6th Conference of the Regulating for Decent Work Network

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9:00am - 9:30am</td>
<td>Opening Ceremony, with Deborah Greenfield (DDG/P, ILO)</td>
<td>GB room (R3 south)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30am - 11:00am</td>
<td>Plenary 1: Keynote Address on &quot;Rethinking Value Creation: Innovation-Led Inclusive Growth&quot; by Mariana Mazzucato</td>
<td>GB room (R3 south)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30am - 1:00pm</td>
<td>Parallel Session 1.6: Special Session on The Future of Work in GSCs (1)</td>
<td>Room IX (R2 south)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Reflections on the Shifting Landscape of GSCs: Technological Change and the Rise of the Global South as Consumers and Manufacturers

The world of work is undergoing major transformations as a result of new business models spurred by technological change, shifting market positions in the global economy, and changing power and sourcing dynamics that directly impact Global Supply Chains (GSCs). The future of GSCs as generators of employment, their implications for working conditions and workers’ well-being, and more broadly their role as a development strategy for developing countries entering the global marketplace are being challenged.

In this context of dramatic transformations in the world of work, this Special Session will provide new perspectives regarding the changing landscape in which GSCs are situated. It will offer insights on what type of innovative policy solutions, experiences and strategies are needed to ensure GSCs can be drivers of inclusive growth and an equitable and just society.

There are several factors shaping the future of work in GSCs and their potential for inclusive growth. One, technological change, including increased digitalization, automation, the use of robotics and 3D printing, poses important questions in terms of the future expansion of GSCs and their role in generating and sustaining employment in both developed and developing countries, and emerging frictions around skill requirements for workers.

Second, another factor to take into account is the changing nature of participation in GSCs of emerging economies in the global South. On the one hand, a trend built on rising middle class and larger domestic demand in producer countries may lead to GSCs to be less dominant in global production. On the other side, the increasing consolidation of GSCs and the presence of new lead firms based in emerging economies are already leading to further expansion of GSCs and of South-South regional trade.

Third, in this context GSC sourcing practices are also changing. Power dynamics among different actors in GSCs, including the increasingly prominent role of intermediaries, vendors and manufacturers in the South, are impacting on market and cost structures in ways that lead to new trends in offshoring and reshoring patterns.

These trends will have significant implications for both scale and quality of employment in GSCs.

The Special Sessions on "Reflections on the Shifting Landscape of Global Supply Chains" comprise of five panels:

1. Technological Change and the Rise of the Global South as Consumers and Manufacturers
2. Changing Supply Chain Structures
3. Governance and Gender
4. Challenges to the Strengthening of Workers' Voice
5. Regulatory Innovations in GSCs: The Case of Better Work

### Presentations of the Special Session

#### Automation, Employment and Reshoring in the Apparel Industry: Long-term Disruption or Storm in a Teacup?

**David Kucera, Fernanda Barcia de Matos**  
International Labour Organization

There is great concern about the impact of automation on employment. It is largely agreed that jobs comprised of repetitive codifiable tasks are at greatest risk, despite limited consensus on the likely magnitude of impacts. The apparel and footwear industry has been strategic in economic development as an entry point onto global markets and as a creator of jobs. Although routine work characterizes the bulk of employment in apparel and footwear manufacturing, the penetration of automation technologies remains limited. Against this background, and as a follow-up a forthcoming ILO report Robotics and Reshoring, this paper offers new insights from interviews with leading brands and retailers in the industry about the current and projected use of technology in apparel and footwear, highlighting practical bottlenecks to what may in theory seem easy to automate and discussing potential implications for the global distribution of production and employment in the sector.
Regional Value Chains and Implications for Decent Work

Khalid Nadvi
University of Manchester

The geopolitics of globalisation are rapidly changing, with consequences for our understanding of global value chains. South-South trade now exceeds South-North trade. While much of this is fuelled by China’s demand for commodities, an emerging middle class in the global South is driving demand for finished goods and services. South-South trade is also influenced by regional trade preferences. Together, these developments underline the growing importance of regional value chains in the global South, in which Southern lead firms play important roles. Regional value chains operate alongside global value chains, but are relatively under-researched. This paper explores the growth of regional value chains, their links to regional trade regimes, and the implications for labour standards and decent work outcomes. It focuses in particular on regional value chains within sub-Saharan Africa, to ask: how best might decent work goals be achieved in regional value chains geared to southern markets?

The Impact of Global Trade Shifts on the Development of Social Standards

Natalie Langford
University of Sheffield

Underglobalisation, the regulation and governance of social standards has increasingly been instigated by private, as well as public actors. The multi-stakeholder initiative (MSI) has emerged as a prominent model through which social standards are governed by firms, civil society and state-based actors. Long established in the global North, MSIs governing social standards are emerging within the global South.

This paper seeks to illustrate the importance of changing geographies of trade and consumption as a driver of firm, civil society and state-led efforts to develop a new multi-stakeholder model designed to govern production in Southern markets, one in which there are new forms of cooperation and contestation between key actors. Using the concept of polycentric trade, this paper illustrates how broader shifts in global trade are affecting the development of standards.

The Role of Multinational Company Strategies in Structuring Global Supply Chains in the Automotive Industry

Tommaso Pardi
CNRS, France

Global Supply Chain (GSC) approaches have highlighted two structuring dynamics in the evolution of economies: the increasing weight of international trade in the production of goods; and the extension of the control of multinational enterprises (MNE) on these fragmented production processes. Two questions occupy a central place in this literature: that of the modes of integration of countries into GSCs and of the economic and social upgrading associated with them; and that of the forms of GSC governance that are defined by MNEs policies and practices, but which can also be challenged by governments and trade unions. In this article we articulate these two issues by focusing on the role of the internationalization strategies of automobile manufacturers in GSCs governance. We begin by developing a synthetic analysis of the internationalization of the 16 major world carmakers over the period 2000-2017. From this empirical study we identify two opposing models: the global-centralised model where the internationalisation is pushed by global platforms conceived by centralized engineering and adapted to emerging markets; and the multi-domestic-decentralised model where the internationalization processes is pulled by the autonomy given to subsidiaries in the design and production of low-cost vehicles for emerging markets.

The article shows that while the global-centralised model remains dominant, it presents limits concerning the forms of upgrading that it produces. Not only does it provide little room for local subsidiaries and enterprises to climb the value chain as the design of platforms and modules are controlled by global firms, but it also polarises the employment relationship between a relatively well-paid core of “high road” workers in the factories of carmakers, and a majority of temporary “low road” workers in the local suppliers. By contrast, the multi-domestic-decentralized model creates more favourable conditions for upgrading: decentralized engineering confers greater autonomy to subsidiaries and relies on local suppliers for “frugal” innovations creating room for functional upgrading; and low-cost production for local markets means that wages and sales can be reconected either because production is more vulnerable to labor blockages, or because companies realize than higher wages in this configuration can lead to higher sales for their products.

On the basis of these findings, we suggest that emerging countries should favour multi-domestic strategies by supporting bottom-up approaches to their markets as India has done with fiscal measures subsidising small cars, or China is pushing forward with a combination of subsidies and quotas to support New Energy Vehicles.

A Comprehensive Global View on Minimum Wages: Evidence on Institutions, Structures, Levels and Compliance

Discussant(s): Uma Rani (ILO)

This special session presents a comprehensive, global picture of the practice and relevance of minimum wages based on a research from the WageIndicator Foundation, which aims to improve wages globally through transparency, and the InGRID2 research infrastructure, a network that aims to make an evidence-based contribution to a European policy strategy of inclusive growth. The session aims to explore the relation between decent work and minimum wages by studying both the institutional characteristics and the outcomes of minimum wage setting.
In the first part of the session, researchers from the University of Amsterdam and WageIndicator address questions of how minimum wage fixing machinery and the structure of minimum wages function in both developing and industrialized countries. These papers contribute to our knowledge of minimum wages by exploring the complexity and diversity of minimum wage fixing around the world. In particular the papers contribute to the literature by analyzing minimum wages in low-, middle-, and high-income countries in a multi-dimensional framework that includes social partners, coverage, and purchasing power. Besamusca compares minimum wage fixing classification in surveys covering different world regions, and proposes a globally applicable coding scheme of minimum wage-setting machinery. Based on the WageIndicator Minimum Wage Database for 118 countries, Tijdens and Van Klaveren systematize the structure and coverage of minimum wages across the world.

The second part of the session focuses on the policy relevance of minimum wages for achieving decent income standards. It addressed questions posed in developing and industrialized countries regarding the value of minimum wages for decent work in the face of non-compliance and their relation to purchasing power. The two papers in this session improve on previous work by taking into account multiple minimum wage rates in a country, rather than using the lowest available minimum wage rate, thus allowing for more accurate comparisons. Addressing the question whether minimum wages can guarantee decent living standards, Kahanec and Guzi show how minimum wage levels compare to living wages in 70 countries, using the innovative online cost of living survey of the WageIndicator Foundation. Finally, using results from 3,194 interviews conducted in 125 garment factories in Indonesia in 2017 and 2018, Pralitasari evaluates compliance with the minimum wage in a low-pay sector. The session is chaired by Dr. Hu; Dr. Rani acts as a discussant. The special session showcases the WageIndicator and InGRID2 research on minimum wages as well as the datasets collected on this theme.

Presentations of the Special Session

Towards a Global Classification of Minimum Wage Fixing Machinery
Janna Besamusca
University of Amsterdam

This paper asks how minimum wages are determined in over 70 countries. In order to do so, we examine the coding schemes used in the ICTWSS dataset and the Eurofound representativeness studies, which were originally developed to apply to a European context and longitudinal data collection, as well as the cross-sectional 2014 ILO General Survey on Minimum Wage Systems and the online information provision through the WageIndicator websites. A coding scheme is developed that takes account of differences in social partner involvement in law and in practice, coverage across the public and private sector, and the presence of multiple rates covering most of the economy.

Understanding the Drivers of Minimum Wages: An Analysis of 118 Countries
Kea Tijdens, Maarten van Klaveren
University of Amsterdam and WageIndicator Foundation

The body of knowledge regarding minimum wages addresses issues like employment effects, median - minimum wage ratios and wage setting mechanisms, but few explore the structure of MW rates. This paper aims to do so, using a new database (WageIndicator Minimum Wage Database) with 10,913 rates from 118 countries (8 without SMW, 50 single rate-SMWs and 60 multiple rate-SMWs, of which India has 7,707 rates, followed by Pakistan (1,426), Indonesia (287) and USA (239). Countries have been positioned on three dimensions: full versus partial coverage (66% of countries have full coverage), purchasing power policies (13% have a geographical breakdown), and replacing collective bargaining (45% of countries). Regional purchasing power policies coverage goes along with both full coverage and replacing bargaining. The larger the population, the more likely countries are to apply regional PP policies.

Living on the Minimum: A Comparison of Minimum Wages and Living Wages in 70 Countries
Martin Guzi1, Martin Kahanec2
1Masaryk University, Brno, 2Central European Labour Studies Institute (CELSI) and Central European University

This paper measures living wages for 70 countries using an innovative web-based method, and compares them to the respective statutory minimum wages and prevailing wages in different occupations. The calculations are based on two million market prices of about 100 items which include food products and services, collected since 2014 through the WageIndicator’s Cost-of-Living Survey. The calculated living wage represents the amount of money sufficient to cover food, accommodation, transportation, health and education expenses together with a provision for unexpected events. Living wages are corrected for income tax and social contributions to be comparable to minimum wages and real wages, which are stipulated as gross earnings. As a normative concept, the living wage offers an additional metric of economic adequacy that reflects the needs of workers and their cost of living.

Monitoring Minimum Wage and Labour Law Compliance in the Indonesian Garment Industry
Nadia Pralitasari
WageIndicator Foundation, Jakarta

This paper discusses an innovative method of monitoring minimum wage and labour law compliance in the context of the WageIndicator Transparency through Mobile Internet project, aiming to empower workers and employers to check, debate and negotiate wages and working conditions in the Indonesian garment industry. 3,194 interviews were conducted in 125 unionized garment factories, using tablets with an app combining the WageIndicator Minimum Wage Database with (regional) minimum wage levels as well as the DecentWorkCheck: a tool developed by the WageIndicator containing 46 compliance measures related to
Indonesian labour law. Preliminary results from interviews conducted between July 2017 and August 2018, indicate that 86 percent of workers in unionized factories is paid at least the relevant minimum wage. Through subsequent factory-level social dialogues meetings, 12 factories have initiated improvements towards compliance, including paying minimum wages, promoting contract workers to permanent workers, and gradually registering workers to social security schemes.

1:30pm - 2:30pm 📚 Book launch
Library

“Gender and Work in Global Value Chains: Capturing the Gains” by Stephanie Barrientos

Automation, Artificial Intelligence and Labour Protection – Part I

This panel is part of a two-panels of a special session whose aim is to fill important gaps in the mainstream debate on automation. This debate has largely concentrated on issues regarding the quantity of jobs that will be lost to automation. Attention to how innovation affects the quality of jobs has lagged behind.

Countless technological devices are invading workplaces. Wearable tools, measuring how fast people complete tasks, where do they move in the workplace and even the quality of their conversations are spreading. Software scanning work emails to track productivity as well as to detect deviant behaviours is also increasingly used. New technologies can have beneficial effects, such as helping with monotonous or hazardous jobs. At the same time, they pave the way to undesirable monitoring and stress at the workplace. Algorithmic-based management can lead to severe forms of discrimination, by hiding bias of programmers behind a technological “objective” façade. This special session aims at highlighting the impact of automation, artificial intelligence and "management by algorithm" on working conditions. Consequences on occupational health and safety and workers' human dignity will also be addressed. Fundamental questions on the consequences of job automation, including re-shoring of production, and proposals to introduce measures such as the Universal Basic Income to deal with job losses will also be examined.

The special session follows an interdisciplinary approach, with contributions from economists, lawyers, and sociologists. Given the dimensions of the topics at hand, we divided this session in two panels.

Presentations of the Special Session

Artificial Intelligence, Occupational Safety and Health and the Future of Work

Valerio De Stefano
Ku Leuven, Belgium

This paper examines the implications of practices such as People Analytics and and the use artificial intelligence to manage the workforce from a legal perspective. It points out that a vital function of labour law is to limit managerial prerogatives to protect the human dignity of workers. In light of this, it argues that even if a Universal Basic Income were introduced, the existence of managerial prerogatives would still warrant the existence of labour regulation since this regulation is about much more than protecting workers’ income. It highlights the benefits of human-rights based approaches to labour regulation to protect workers’ privacy against invasive electronic monitoring. It concludes by highlighting the crucial role of collective regulation and social partners in governing automation and the impact of technology at the workplace by calling for collective actors to actively participate in the governance of technology-enhanced management systems, to ensure a vital “human-in-command” approach.

Robotics and Reshoring: The Apparel and Electronics Industries.

David Kucera, Fernanda Barcia de Mattos
International Labour Office

This paper addressing the implication of re-shoring and automation for employment in industrialised and developing countries.

Artificial Intelligence, Occupational Safety and Health and the Future of Work

Phoebe Moore
University of Leicester

This paper looks at the use of AI enhanced applications in workplaces, looking at what the implications are for of workers’ occupational safety and health (OSH). To identify this, the paper outlines where and how AI is being applied in the workplace, covering AI augmented robotics (cobots) and chatbots; the uses of wearable technologies and assistive tablets on the production assembly line; and algorithmic processes in gig work. Each section outlines the benefits and risks that AI presents for OSH at work. Then, the paper suggests worker training and outlines government and international responses to the rising risks and benefits to AI at work. In conclusion, the paper provides some recommendations for how to best manage and mitigate the worst risks that could arise with AI in workplaces.
Digital Platforms, Data and Development: Implications for Workers in Developing Economies

Uma Rani¹, Parminder Jeet Singh²
¹International Labour Office, ²IT for Change

There is increased push towards digital technologies in developing countries, and the need to build digital infrastructure as important levers to foster development and to help the most vulnerable populations. Little is known about the impacts of digital technologies on the workers in the global South, and what is good for development and employment. In this context, this paper will look at three areas where labour relationship relates to digital economy. First, whether artificial intelligence and machine learning process can displace labour through this process. Second, data are central to the digital economy, and who owns and controls the data or can harvest the meaning of data becomes important and there are major players coming into this market. Third, relates to the issue of e-commerce and the push towards free digital marketplace.

Parallel Session 2.6: Special Session on The Future of Work in GSCs (2)

Session Chair: Stephanie Barrientos

Reflections on the Shifting Landscape of GSCs: Changing Supply Chain Structures

The world of work is undergoing major transformations as a result of new business models spurred by technological change, shifting market positions in the global economy, and changing power and sourcing dynamics that directly impact Global Supply Chains (GSCs). The future of GSCs as generators of employment, their implications for working conditions and workers' well-being, and more broadly their role as a development strategy for developing countries entering the global marketplace are being challenged.

In this context of dramatic transformations in the world of work, this Special Session will provide new perspectives regarding the changing landscape in which GSCs are situated. It will offer insights on what type of innovative policy solutions, experiences and strategies are needed to ensure GSCs can be drivers of inclusive growth and an equitable and just society.

There are several factors shaping the future of work in GSCs and their potential for inclusive growth. First, technological change, including increased digitalization, automation, the use of robotics and 3D printing, poses important questions in terms of the future expansion of GSCs and their role in generating and sustaining employment in both developed and developing countries, and emerging frictions around skill requirements for workers.

Second, is the changing nature of participation in GSCs of emerging economies in the global South. On the one hand, a trend built on rising middle class and larger domestic demand in producer countries may lead to GSCs to be less dominant in global production. On the other side, the increasing consolidation of GSCs and the presence of new lead firms based in emerging economies are already leading to further expansion of GSCs and of South-South regional trade.

Third, in this context GSC sourcing practices are also changing. Power dynamics among different actors in GSCs, including the increasingly prominent role of intermediaries, vendors and manufacturers in the South, are impacting on market and cost structures in ways that lead to new trends in offshoring and reshoring patterns.

These trends will have significant implications for both scale and quality of employment in GSCs.

The Special Sessions on "Reflections on the Shifting Landscape of Global Supply Chains" comprise of five panels:

1. Technological Change and the Rise of the Global South as Consumers and Manufacturers
2. Changing Supply Chain Structures
3. Governance and Gender
4. Challenges to the Strengthening of Workers' Voice
5. Regulatory Innovations in GSCs: The Case of Better Work

Presentations of the Special Session

Re-structuring the Supply Chain to Achieve integration Between Sourcing and Compliance: A Case Study of a Global Brand

Sarosh Kuruvilla
Cornell University

Institutional theory suggests that the organizational field of private regulation in GSCs is characterized by a high degree of practice-outcomes decoupling, i.e., that the private regulation practices of global companies do not result in concrete improvements in working conditions of workers. One explanation for the practice-outcomes gap is the failure to integrate sourcing and compliance policies and practices within global firms. Sourcing managers and compliance staff might respond to different incentives that do not permit that integration. This case focuses on a global company that has embarked on a re-organization of its GSC, partly to facilitate integration. The case suggests that integration is difficult, requires a re-organization of traditional approaches to both sourcing and compliance, needs internal champions who drive the effort, and requires a mental shift among sourcing personnel who pursue a transactional sourcing strategy. The case highlights the organizational effort and timeframe required to integrate sourcing with compliance.
The Link between Economic and Social Upgrading in Global Supply Chains: Experiences from the Southern Cone of Latin America

Gerhard Reinecke¹, Anne Posthuma²
¹International Labour Office, Santiago, ²International Labour Office, Brasilia

The expansion of GSCs has been relatively less studied in the countries of the Southern Cone of Latin America (Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Paraguay and Uruguay). This article examines economic and social upgrading and several governance dimensions across nine case studies of supply chains in agriculture, industry and business services sectors.

This article focuses particularly upon the links between economic and social upgrading and the extent to which Lead Firms diffuse upgrading processes to their suppliers. The research findings reveal that, while many Lead Firm segments in the nine GSC case studies attain economic and social upgrading, little evidence was found of upgrading spillovers to suppliers of inputs and intermediary goods and services, particularly when these suppliers were engaged in lower value-added, resource-intensive and labour-intensive activities. The article identifies three types of relationships between Lead Firms and suppliers: oppositional development; truncated development; and integrated upgrading within the chain.

The Future of Work in the South Indian Garment Sector: An Adjacent Problem Method

Michael Bloomfield¹, Vivek Soundararajan², Genevieve LeBaron², Andrew Crane³, Laura Spence⁴
¹University of Toronto, ²International Labour Organization, ³University of Sheffield, ⁴University of Bath, ⁵Royal Holloway, University of London

A key challenge in GVCs is labour exploitation, driven by low-cost business models. Top-down initiatives such as social auditing, multi-stakeholder initiatives have limited effectiveness partly because they fail to address workers’ priorities at the bottom of supply chains. A future of work that differs from the status quo of exploitation, requires a new approach. Using original primary data collected in the South Indian garment sector, we radically reimagine the problem from the perspective of business actors at the bottom of supply chains. Introducing an adjacent problem method, labour exploitation is addressed by focussing on solving adjacent problems (e.g. labour scarcity) identified by businesses and identifying ethical approaches to overcome them. We identify four pathways to overcome labour scarcity: economic upgrading; migrant workforce; manufacturing relocation; and diversification. The problem-solving method begins with redefining labour issues in GVCs ‘from the bottom up’ and embedding wider GVC governance priorities within the prospective solutions.

The Things that Matter Most at Work for Flourishing in Life: A Cross-Cultural Comparison of Well-being in Apparel Supply Chain Workers

Eileen McNeely¹, Tamar Koosed², Carlued Carlued Leon³, Dorota Weziak-Bialosowska²
¹Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, United States of America; ³Manaus

Background

Work is an important platform for obtaining resources to flourish in life. Many studies on work and health focus only on negative consequences, such as mental or physical disability. In the apparel industry, compliance audits also monitor negative conditions only, such as human rights violations or occupational health and safety risks. In this paper, we evaluate the work conditions that contribute to positive well-being at work (happy, healthy, and engaged workers) and to positive well-being in life (meaning and purpose, social connectedness, emotional health, and character strength, in addition to financial security and physical health). We aim to understand which work resources make the greatest difference in people’s lives, especially for unskilled workers in poor regions.

Methods

We surveyed over 11,000 apparel workers across seven suppliers, 13 garment factories, and five countries between 2017 and 2019. The survey assessed well-being across several dimensions of human flourishing. It also collected information on work resources that workers perceived as supportive to their well-being, such as trust, fairness, respect, and adequate physical working conditions. We benchmarked differences across suppliers and countries. Using cross-sectional data from five countries and longitudinal data from Mexico, we also conducted a multivariate analysis of the work resources that contribute most to flourishing at work and in life.

Results

Work resources affect workers’ ability to thrive in and outside of the workplace. Each workplace resource examined affected at least one dimension of flourishing at work and of flourishing in life. The state of physical working conditions was generally the most influential factor affecting human flourishing. We also found that when workers thrive at the workplace, they also flourish in life: job satisfaction, positive mood at work, and self-reported productivity were the factors contributing the most to flourishing in life.

Expectations vs. Reality: The Well-being of Female Migrant Workers in Garment Factories in Myanmar

Hanh Nguyen
Centre for Economic and Social Development, Myanmar
Voluntary Industry Self-Regulation in Supply Chains and the Prospects for the Health and Safety of Non-Standard Workers?

Louise Thornthwaite
Macquarie University, Australia

While the scholarly literature on industry supply chain self-regulation generally lacks optimism about the prospects for extensive improvements in work health and safety, there has been little empirical analysis of the impacts such regulatory mechanisms have, both broadly and in particular industry sectors, including those with large segments of non-standard workers. Such schemes have proliferated in domestic supply chains in the transportation sector, in which a large proportion of work is sub-contracted to small one-two truck operators. The paper addresses the following question. Do such voluntary industry-based regulatory institutions provide prospects for improved health and safety for subcontractors?

This paper provides a preliminary analysis of data from research on voluntary industry regulation in Australia’s retail transport and logistics industry, focusing on codes of conduct and accompanying accreditation schemes. The methodology included 30 semi-structured interviews with industry participants, to identify their perceptions of, and experiences with three accreditation systems. The interview transcripts were subject to a two-stage InVivo iterative thematic analysis, as well as participant observation at a two-day Industry Forum which facilitated a deeper understanding of industry context, dynamics and discourses. The paper identifies key ways in which industry self-regulation can assist in improving safety outcomes and a number of factors which limit and impair positive outcomes. Policy implications of these findings are explored, with recommendations proposed for operational changes to improve the contribution of voluntary industry regulatory mechanisms on health and safety outcomes.


Teodora Mariova Petrova
Max Planck Institute for Social Law and Social Policy, Germany

While corporate business activities can contribute to economic and social development, they can also bear considerable labour risks. Apparel production illustrates this point clearly due to the specifics of the fast-fashion industry, resulting in labour violations under the industry’s supply chains. Over the last years labour rights’ violations in subcontracted clothing manufacturers in Eastern Europe are increasingly coming to the fore, exposing the national regulatory frameworks’ limits.

Despite that the questions on business’ labour rights obligations have been examined through many angles, the academic scholarship has not yet given sufficient account on how the different components of labour regulation and private regulation interact between each other and shape labour rights’ protection. Even if the role of different private regulation measures is studied in relation to the law, such measures are treated as a global model which is applicable in different national and international settings. Yet, the “one size fits all” approach is unable to reflect on the particularities of the national application of private regulation and its interaction with domestic governance.

The main research question thus focuses on how labour regulation and private regulation in the Eastern European apparel-supplying industry should interact in shaping the upholding of labour rights, with a special focus on the right to freedom of association and collective bargaining. The research utilizes a theory-developing question and has a recommendatory objective, sensitive to the realities of post-socialist governance spheres. The study contributes to the scholarly literature with a more nuanced theoretical understanding of the functioning and interactions of the different legal, but also private regulatory processes, which shape the labour rights protection in the clothing suppliers to multinational enterprises.

Due to the article’s limited size, the text looks into the tendencies of subcontracted garment-production in the Eastern European states and chooses to provide a more detailed analysis on the situation in Bulgaria, further motivated by recent reports on the troubling labour conditions in the supply chains in the country. The study demonstrates that private measures like Global Framework Agreements can at some instances eventually contribute to labour rights protection throughout the supply chain in a manner which is more effective than the law. Private regulation measures developed through work with social partners can adopt...
a flexible and targeted approach needed to contribute to the labour rights in question. The legal discourse is yet to find appropriate ways to manage and encourage such private initiatives.

---

**6:00pm - 7:30pm**

**Movie: "Rethabile's Story"**

Screening of "Rethabile's Story" (25 minutes) - a short film on everyday life in the Lesotho garment factories. The screening will be followed by a roundtable discussion on Africa and the Future of Work

**7:30pm**

**Reception**

Hosted by the ILO

---

**Date: Tuesday, 09/Jul/2019**

**9:00am - 10:30am**

Parallel Session 4.2: Rethinking Globalization and Institutions (2)

Session Chair: Virginia Doellgast

**Predatory Purchasing Practices in Global Supply Chains and the Relevance of a Universal Labour Guarantee**

**Mark Anner**

Penn State University, United States of America

In January 2019, the ILO released the Global Commission on the Future of Work report, Work for a Brighter Future. In the report, the Commission recommended the establishment of a Universal Labour Guarantee through which all workers, regardless of their employment status, would enjoy fundamental workers’ rights, an adequate living wage, maximum limits on working hours, and protection of safety and health at work (p. 12). These four elements are particularly relevant for workers at the bottom tiers of global supply chains where unionization rates are low, wages most often do not cover living needs, working hours are excessively long, and building safety has become an issue of extreme urgency.

This paper argues that a Universal Labour Guarantee can contribute to transforming predatory purchasing practices in global supply chains. This argument is explored using the case of the apparel global supply chains where, since the 1990s, there has been increased consolidation of lead firms relative to supplier firms. This growing power asymmetry have motivated firms to push down on wages, increase working time, turn to a range of contingent and other non-standard forms of work, and resort to sub-standard factories. And because unions are perceived to increase costs, firms feel a growing incentive to keep unions out of factories, often by violating workers’ rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining.

To explore this argument, data were gathered in India in 2017 and 2018 through field research, stakeholder interviews and original surveys of 340 supplier factories and 560 workers. Trade data were also examined for Indian exports to establish pricing trends over time. What this paper finds is that between 1994 and 2017 there was a 62.81 per cent decline in the real dollar amount paid per square meter by US retailers and brands for apparel imported from India. This price squeeze, combined with fluctuations in order volume over time, resulted in increases in: 1. Overtime hours (often obligatory); 2. The use of contingent work; 3. Work intensity; and 4. Subcontracting of production. Only 5 per cent of workers indicated that their straight wages covered their living expenses, and only 2 per cent of workers reported knowing about a union in their workplace. A Universal Labour Guarantee, if properly and universally implemented, could change the incentive structure in global supply chains, and push lead firms to compete on factors other than low wages, long hours, and union avoidance in their suppliers.

---

**Hybrid Production Regimes, Transnational Governance of Labor Standards and Workers’ Agency**

**Nicole Helmerich**¹, **Jean-Christophe Graz**²

¹University of Lausanne; ²University of Lausanne

Many transnational private initiatives claim to respond to governance deficits resulting from the globalization of production. Emerging scholarship has pointed out that their effectiveness largely depends on the role of national and local contexts, including workers’ own agency. We develop the concept of hybrid production regime (HPRs) to examine more specifically how such a variety of transnational and national characteristics impact on workers’ capacity to act. Hybrid production regimes are a configuration of institutions, policies, and practices that involve state and non-state actors in the organization of global production. Yet, little do we know about different HPRs spanning from the transnational, national to the local level, and how their composition enables or hinders actors to exercise three collective competences, access, inclusion and leverage in the regime.

Based on a dataset of 160 companies in three countries (Kenya, Tanzania, Brazil) across three sectors (agriculture, manufacturing, tourism), we study the interactions of transnational and national levels within the hybrid production regimes and their impact on workers’ agency. We discuss to what extent private regulatory initiatives differ from or supplement national labor institutions and what this means for workers’ capacity to act to improve their employment conditions.

---

**Global Labour Governance System and Pathways for its Development**

**Aneta Tyc**

University of Lodz, Poland

As the International Labour Organization (ILO) celebrates its 100th anniversary in 2019, it is unavoidable to take stock of the effectiveness of its enforcement mechanisms. Although the ILO has proved its capacity to define, evaluate, and monitor international labour standards, it lacks tools to enforce compliance with ILO
agreements. Procedural compliance, concerned with formal obligations such as reporting, seems to be on the decline. Substantive compliance, i.e. whether states have fulfilled obligations set out in an international instrument, is also unsatisfactory, especially in terms that ILO appears to be unable to respond to cases of non-compliance. As ILO has no effective mechanism to impose sanctions against countries that fail to comply with its agreements, many authors draw attention to the potential of the WTO in this regard. This paper details whether labour standards should be left to the ILO (eg. Hepple, 2008), encompassed by the WTO agencies; Cohan Bialkowski, 2016; Wolfgang and Feuerhake, 2002) or both forces should be combined (the institutional approach), eg. the Agency for Trade and Labour Standards “ATLAS” jointly governed by the WTO and the ILO (Barry and Reddy, 2008); joint ILO-GATT/WTO Enforcement Regime (Ehrenberg, 1996); the concept of a global labour and trade framework agreement “GLTFA” (Addo, 2015).

The paper also focuses on the integrated legislative approach which consists in the integration of core labour standards (CLS) into the WTO through changes to law, eg. the view according to which the WTO should build on Article XX(e) of GATT by adding a provision that allows countries to sanction the specific sector of a country that has violated CLS, if the ILO has determined that there is a violation (eg. Elliott, Freeman, 2003; Plasa, 2015). The study contributes to the literature by offering additional insights on the institutional approach and the integrated legislative approach. The paper concludes by suggesting an option that would be the most feasible and could be realized during the forthcoming wave of reforms aiming at strengthening the WTO. Thus, the findings complement existing research on possible future strategies.

---

**Social Compliance and Gender in Global Value Chains: addressing the failure on gender discrimination**

**Stephanie Barrientos**, Charlotte Pallangyo

1 University of Manchester, United Kingdom; 2 WG Inclusive

Civil society organisations have long engaged in advocacy and campaigns over poor labour conditions in global value chains. Governance of suppliers by most leading multinational companies (MNC) now includes codes of labour practice requiring them to comply with international labour standards. The more comprehensive codes are based on Core ILO Conventions, including no discrimination. Social compliance (standard setting, monitoring and auditing of codes) has gone some way in addressing ‘measurable standards’ such as worker health and safety. However it rarely identify or address ‘enabling rights’ including gender discrimination and sexual harassment. This is evidenced by less than 1% of audits identifying these issues, even in countries and sectors where other evidence indicates they are rife. Many MNCs now recognize the limitations of audits and are exploring initiatives ‘beyond compliance’, some with a gender focus.

This paper asks: What are the systemic barriers underlying the failure of social compliance to identify or address gender discrimination, and how could gender equality in global value chains be enhanced? It draws on over a decade of research on gender and work in global value chains. It is informed by recent research undertaken in the DFID programme on ‘Work and Opportunities for Women’ (WOW) mapping gender and visibility of women in apparel, horticulture and personal care value chains in Africa and Asia.

Research underpinning WOW included an examination of social compliance procedures and initiatives involving the value chains of selected MNCs.

The paper explores the issues from the perspective of a gender analysis of governance of global value chains, examining the inter-layering of social, private and public governance. It argues that private governance, through top down social compliance restricted to the commercial sphere of paid work is disconnected from women’s caring roles and wider societal norms of gender subordination. Social governance (through NGO and trade unions advocacy and campaigns), that transcends the commercial and societal spheres, continues to highlight the ‘reputational risks’ to MNCs of failing to address gender discrimination and sexual harassment in their supply base. MNCs are also unable to harness the business and development benefits of greater gender equality. The paper argues that sustainable change is only possible when public governance (national and international) can be more effectively linked to private and social governance to promote gender equality across global value chains. However this requires a broader gender shift in the current inter-layering of public, private and social governance.

---

**Changes in the Governance of Garment Global Production Networks: Lead Firm, Supplier and Institutional Responses to the Rana Plaza Disaster and Related Worker Outcomes**


1 Johannes Kepler University; 2 University of New South Wales; 3 London School of Economics and Political Science, United Kingdom; 4 University of Gothenburg; 5 BRAC Institute of Governance and Development; 6 Royal Holloway University of London; 7 Freie Universität Berlin; 8 BRAC University; 9 University of Liberal Arts Bangladesh

The Rana Plaza disaster in Bangladesh killed over 1,000 garment workers and shocked the world. This study seeks to understand changes in global governance of labour in garment supply chains since then, drawing insights from the Garment Supply Chain Governance Project (www.garmentgov.de), a global coalition of academic researchers, exploring the evolution of labour governance.

Our paper draws on three main sources of international data: data on garment workers collected through a survey of 1,500 workers, focus groups and interviews with workers; a survey conducted with 152 export-oriented garment factory managers in Bangladesh; 177 interviews conducted with 79 leading garment buyers from Australia, Germany, Sweden and the UK. These data are complemented by over 60 stakeholder interviews and observational and documentary data on policy development in the five countries.

The paper provides the most comprehensive report to date on leading buyers’ current practices, changes perceived by workers and experiences of factory managers with initiatives to improve factory safety.
Push or Pull? Drivers of Female Labor Force Drop-Outs in the era of Transnational Governance in Bangladesh after the Rana Plaza Disaster

Kazi Mahmudur Rahman
University of Liberal Arts Bangladesh (ULAB), Bangladesh, People's Republic of

Over the last few years in Bangladesh, it has been observed that female garments workers during their mid-career drop out from their factory job challenging the trade-led development discourse ("sweatshops are the first rung on the ladder out of the extreme poverty" (Sachs, 2005, p. 11)). Pre-Rana Plaza data shows that women made up around 80% of the labour force of the garments industries. In 2015, the female to male workers' participation ratio was 64:36, but in 2018 it has now declined to 60.8: 39.2 (CPD, 2018).

There are limited but innumerable dimensions has been commented by others to unpack the reasons for such drop out. For example, due to the Accord and Alliance building safety initiatives, a number of (750) small and medium sized factories have been closed subsequently resulted women job loss (the independent, 14 May 2014; The Financial Express, 11 May 2014). Whereas, others cited that declining of employment has been associated with upgrading of technology and use of modern machinery (CPD, 2018; Islam and Rahman, 2017). Interestingly, despite limited research on demand side perspectives of workers drop out, from the supply side (workers) perspective, reasons/factors for such drop is yet to divulge. Against this background, this paper raises two interlinked question, what are the key factors and causes of female workers leaving the RMG sector after the Rana Plaza incidents? Is there any connections to this Accord/Alliance governance and/or technology up-gradation? This paper is based on in-depth interviews with 20 female garments workers which are collected through a snowball sample technique. We draw on Schultz and Becker's "Human Capital Theory" and McMichael's (2010) critical development theory (the pursuit of development through a "market episteme" is problematic) to frame our analysis. This paper argues that the female workers have been made extremely vulnerable to a highly fragmented production process and the demands of its ever-increasing rationalisation which has failed to ensure the promised "freedom" for the workers. Not all conceive of the economic impact of the garments employment in such positive terms, including and especially the workers themselves. The framing of the "development project" (McMichael, 2010) and its contradictions as "common sense" (and/or as external to the development process itself) is not as stable as its advocates would hold.

Parallel Session 5.6: Special Session on the Future of Work in GSCs (5)

Session Chair: Arianna Rossi

Regulatory Innovations in GSCs: The Case of Better Work

The world of work is undergoing major transformations as a result of new business models spurred by technological change, shifting market positions in the global economy, and changing power and sourcing dynamics that directly impact Global Supply Chains (GSCs). The future of GSCs as generators of employment, their implications for working conditions and workers' well-being, and more broadly their role as a development strategy for developing countries entering the global marketplace are being challenged.

In this context of dramatic transformations in the world of work, this Special Session will provide new perspectives regarding the changing landscape in which GSCs are situated. It will offer insights on what type of innovative policy solutions, experiences and strategies are needed to ensure GSCs can be drivers of inclusive growth and an equitable and just society.

There are several factors shaping the future of work in GSCs and their potential for inclusive growth. First, technological change, including increased digitalization, automation, the use of robotics and 3D printing, poses important questions in terms of the future expansion of GSCs and their role in generating and sustaining employment in both developed and developing countries, and emerging frictions around skill requirements for workers.

Second, the changing nature of participation in GSCs of emerging economies in the global South. On the one hand, a trend built on rising middle class and larger domestic demand in producer countries may lead to GSCs to be less dominant in global production. On the other side, the increasing consolidation of GSCs and the presence of new lead firms based in emerging economies are already leading to further expansion of GSCs and of South-South regional trade.

Third, in this context GSC sourcing practices are also changing. Power dynamics among different actors in GSCs, including the increasingly prominent role of intermediaries, vendors and manufacturers in the South, are impacting on market and cost structures in ways that lead to new trends in offshoring and reshoring patterns.

These trends will have significant implications for both scale and quality of employment in GSCs. The Special Sessions on "Reflections on the Shifting Landscape of Global Supply Chains" comprise of five panels:

1. Technological Change and the Rise of the Global South as Consumers and Manufacturers
2. Changing Supply Chain Structures
3. Governance and Gender
4. Challanges to the Strengthening of Workers' Voice
5. Regulatory Innovations in GSCs: The Case of Better Work
The Impact of Better Factories Cambodia on Worker Wellbeing
Ana Antolin, Drusilla Brown
Tufts University

This paper presents findings from a quasi-randomized controlled trial of the impact of Better Factories Cambodia (BFC) on worker wellbeing. BFC is a program that monitors factory compliance with national and international labor standards. Factory random assignment to treatment cohorts allows us to measure the impact of single audits as well as the cumulative effect of the program over time. We seek to address BFC’s impact beyond labor standard compliance towards workers’ perception of their own wellbeing as they progress through the program. We find that BFC has largely positive effects with some mixed effects. The program positively impacts wages, excess overtime, worker job and life satisfaction, worker empowerment, and many experiences of sexual harassment in the factory.

Through these results, we contribute to the literature debating effective methods of regulating and improving working conditions in factories, with a focus on how compliance audits with supplemental advisory services can positively affect worker wellbeing in a number of dimensions.

Lights On: Transparency and Compliance: Evidence from Better Factories Cambodia
Raymond Robertsom
Texas A&M University

This paper evaluates the implementation of transparency in garment factories in Cambodia through the Better Factories Cambodia program. Using a difference-in-difference approach that is often applied to control for endogeneity, this paper finds that compliance improved following the implementation of transparency. Compliance increased in a group of 21 critical compliance areas that represent fundamental worker rights relative to relevant comparison groups. Compliance among the least-compliant factories, however, did not increase relative to other factories, possibly reflecting limited access to resources.

Mature Industrial Relations and the Dynamics of Social Dialogue in Better Work: Evidence from the Field on their Contribution to Compliance
Anil Verma¹, Luisa Lupo²
¹University of Toronto, ²International Labour Organization

While the general relationship between Better Work (BW) inputs and outcomes in terms of improvements in compliance with labour standards are well established, less is known about the contribution of workplace industrial relations to the overall effect. To better understand the internal dynamics of workplace industrial relations (IR), we posit that worker-management relations “mature” over time, i.e., while the two sides who have incentives to fight as well as cooperate, they learn to dialogue with each other in order to maximize their gains. This paper delves into data from several countries to identify measures of “mature” IR at the factory level and to present evidence on their properties such as trends over time, variance across factories. We correlate measures of “mature” IR with structural variables such as factory size, type of union, and management resistance. Analysis of quantitative data collected from surveys is supplemented with qualitative data gathered from interviews and progress reports.

From Auditor to Trainer: How Buyers Can Play a More Active Role in Strengthening Industrial Relations and Social Dialogue in Supply Chains
Kelly Pike
York University

The Workplace Cooperation Program (WCP) is a partnership between Better Work (BW) and Gap Inc. aimed at strengthening workplace cooperation in both BW and non-BW factories in Bangladesh, Cambodia, China, Guatemala, India, Jordan, Philippines and Vietnam. The project aims at training workers and managers to more effectively address non-compliance issues and to broaden workplace cooperation. The two-fold objectives are to provide: (1) Training of Trainers for Gap Inc. staff on modules on industrial relations and social dialogue, and (2) Skills training for Gap Inc. staff to deliver these modules. This paper is an evaluation of the WCP and highlights its key strengths and challenges. Evidence suggests that this is a valuable pilot and feasible model to expand with some adjustments.
The study project aims to deepen the implications of technological transformation with particular reference to the protection of health and safety of workers. Technological innovation, as we know, has had significant repercussions on the organization of production factors. Many digital devices have made their appearance in the production environment: from cell phones to electronic wristband, from 3D printers to artificial intelligence and so on. All these new machines have a dark side: they have the potential to cause risks to human health, but the science is not yet able to grasp or it may happen that the scientific evidence is created by the same device manufacturers which produces a sort of "scientific pollution". Paradigmatic in this regard is the example of the electromagnetic fields emitted by several devices: the Directive 2013/35/EU, on the protection against exposure to electromagnetic fields, explicitly excludes from its scope the prevention of long-term carcinogenic effects, because there is currently non conclusive scientific evidence establishing a causal relationship. In this context, one wonders about which standard of protection the risk mitigation and prevention criterion must settle. In several countries there has been a precautionary approach to manage these phenomena. The application of the precautionary principle, however, to the head of civil and criminal liability of the employer involves some twists. Indeed, if on the one hand it has positive effects because it involves the obligation to take protective measures against risks, which are not probable but possible; on the other hand, in the field of responsibility, it could alter the assessment of the causal link and the guilt of the agent. For these reasons, it seems necessary in the «risk society» to start conceiving new strategies to manage the unknown risk for health and safety. We need to start thinking ultimately about a “new legal construction” of science and technology. In this process, the National States must play a strategic role by not failing to take clear positions on the complex mechanisms of the market economy to re-establish social cohesion. To answer the question below will be necessary to focus on European and Italian System of protection of Health and safety in the workplace and compare it with USA system, where the EPA, OSHA, NIOSH federal agency are implementing precautionary strategy against risks gathering by scientific and technological development.

What are the Impacts of Work Design and Organizational Practices on Employee Health and Well-being?

Tobias Haepp
Institute for Employment Research (IAB), Germany

This paper employs a new matched employer-employee dataset to analyze the impact of work design and organizational practices on several measures of employee health and well-being. In particular, we make use of the Linked Personnel Panel (LPP), which is a unique personnel economics data set from Germany containing survey information on both employees and their firms.

The LPP survey has been implemented in 2013, 2015, and 2017, thus permitting an analysis of recent trends in work design such as telework and organizational practices such as appraisal interviews and performance bonuses. The main outcome variables analyzed are job satisfaction, intentions to change employer, subjective employee assessments of their physical health, the number of annual sick days, and psychological well-being (WHO-5).

The first part of our analysis describes recent trends in our variables of interest. In the second part of our analysis, we then implement panel data regressions controlling for both worker and firm effects to identify the causal effects of work design and organizational practices on employee health and wellbeing outcomes.

We find that teleworking, training provision, appraisal interviews, performance bonuses and overtime pay all improve job satisfaction. Training provision and appraisal interviews also improve psychological well-being, but none of the features considered exert a significant impact on self-assessed physical well-being.

Our work contributes to the literature in several ways. First, by using an innovative matched employeremployee data set we can control for confounding factors at both the worker and the firm level that cannot be accounted for in ordinary survey data or macro level data sets and identify the causal effects of work design and organizational practices. Second, the LPP was specifically designed to examine the impact of human resource management practices on employees and thus provides a wide array of detailed analyses.
variables permitting an assessment of the relative and combined impacts of each factor on a number of outcomes at the employee level.

From a policy perspective, our work provides important insights to governments about changes in work design and organizational practices that should be institutionally encouraged to ensure worker health and well-being in the face of an increasingly challenging work environment characterized by the effects of globalization and technological change.

---

**Impact of Work Design on Safety, Health & Well-Being of Female Workers in Textile Sector of Pakistan**

**Summiya Zahidi**  
International Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan

Textile is the largest manufacturing industry, employs about 45% of the total labor force (38% of the total manufacturing workers) in the country which includes only 24% women and contributes 8.5% to the GDP of Pakistan. According to the latest census report 31.70% of the labor force employed in different sectors of Pakistan out of which 48.32% are male and 14.52% are female. Out of 153 countries, Pakistan is ranked 4th worst country for women due to highest discrimination against women and lowest financial inclusion. In most of textile factories, labour laws are not observed, health & safety situation are highly unsatisfactory and work design are not compliant as per international standard which cause frequent workplace accidents. There is severe need to protect workers’ health and wellbeing to safeguard the community at large. The purpose of this study is to examine the effect of the work design on safety, health and wellbeing of workers in textile sector of Pakistan. This quantitative correlational study is conducted in textile sector of the Pakistan. Primary data is collected through questionnaires from 217-female textile workers. This study is aimed at policymakers and practitioners to understand the impact of work design and set the minimum benchmark to ensure the safety, health and wellbeing of workers at workplace. This research found a strong positive relationship between these variable and compare our results to the wider literature.

---

**Access to Justice after Rana Plaza**

**Youbin Kang**  
University of Wisconsin - Madison, United States of America

The problem of access to justice by the have-nots, especially oriented towards changing institutionalized legal practice, has been a central question in the law and society literature. For garment workers in Bangladesh, structural barriers to their ability in finding solace in the domestic legal system are multiple – many workers are illiterate, many workers are not aware of their rights, the costs of litigation are high, the backlog of the courts are significant, and non-compliance to the law in garment factories are widespread. This lack of justice for garment workers was tragically materialized in the Rana Plaza disaster. In 2013 more than a thousand workers died in a collapsed building which housed multiple unauthorized floors of sewing facilities in a building called Rana Plaza in Savar, Bangladesh. Following this disaster, a variety of legal and institutional reforms have been introduced in the garment sector. How did the critical moment in 2013 change patterns of how garment workers file for grievances?

Avenues of grievance redress for garment workers have expanded after 2013, particularly through the funding of international donors and transnational institutions such as the global framework agreements signed between IndustriALL and four multinational brands. The increased forti and resources for access to justice point to significant changes in workers’ legal activities. I examine these changes through a case study of a prominent legal aid NGO. The dataset obtained from the NGO lists 2027 grievances raised from 2004 to 2017 (1537 after dropping missing values). Descriptive statistics from this database reveals two particularly interesting trends. Firstly, there was a significant increase in grievance procedure related cases. Disaggregating this data by the judgments issued by the court, most grievance procedures related cases from 2009-12 were dismissed due to the absence of the petitioner, while in 2013-17, there have been more varied outcomes. Secondly, after 2013, the data shows that women plaintiffs have received more money through court in wage-related lawsuits compared to men. The amount increased by threefold for women and twofold for men between the periods of 2009-12 and 2013-17. This trend is most interesting given that the female-share of participation in courts has decreased over the years. Qualitative interviews with lawyers, workers, a judge, and trade unions point to the increased consciousness of workers, and the latent effects of gendered intervention by transnational actors as leading explanations of the changes described.

---

**The Brazilian Labour Prosecution Office and Business Liability for Human Rights Violations in Supply Chains**

**Flávia Scabin, Tamara Brezighello Hojaij**  
Fundação Getulio Vargas, Brazil

The process of economic globalization led to the development of new business models, based on complex supply chains, extended across borders and multiple jurisdictions. This new dynamics altered employment and production relations, creating opportunities and challenges for compliance with human and labour rights by businesses. Global supply chains enabled buyers to reduce costs by comparing production strategies in different locations, as well as enabled workers’ access to high-skilled jobs. Hence, suppliers in the lower links of supply chains often operate in informal markets and are subjected to price competition and tight delivery times. Combined, these conditions can favour the non-compliance with and sometimes the violation of human and labour rights standards.

In Brazil, this context challenges the foundations of businesses’ liability for rights violations, since the current legislation relies on the direct link between the damage and the action or omission that caused it. Hence, the Labour Prosecution Office (LPO) and the Judiciary have been holding businesses liable for
conditions analogous to slavery throughout supply chains, alleging their complicity, as they do not inspect suppliers. In such cases, both businesses and LPO have preferred to settle a Conduct Adjustment Agreement (CAA), instead of waiting years for a Court's definitive solution. CAAs, consequently, have been a recurring tool involving conditions analogous to slavery in supply chains in different sectors.

This paper aims at comprehending what are the parameters and criteria used by the LPO in the CAAs signed with apparel businesses, focusing on operations in the Municipality of São Paulo. The study draws on data mining and qualitative data analysis.

This paper contributes to the literature on international business and emerging economies by (i) promoting convergence between the decent work and business and human rights agendas in the Brazilian context and clarifying (ii) the LPO role in guaranteeing human and labour rights and (iii) the challenges to overcome limits to law enforcement in the case of supply chains.

The study concludes that the CAAs are a valuable instrument to meet the growing social expectation for business to respect human and labour rights in their supply chains. They establish covenants that hold businesses in the end of the chain liable for rights violations, going beyond traditional employment relationships. However, these covenants are still grounded in corporate social responsibilities practices, such as inspection audits, in concrete often limited to the level of the factory and first-tier suppliers, missing a systemic and preventive approach.

Decent Work Regulation in Africa: A Global Multi-scalar Dialogue on Labour Standards Enforcement in Southern Africa

Deirdre McCann¹, Kelly Pike², Debbie Collier³

¹University of Durham, United Kingdom; ²York University, Canada; ³University of Cape Town, South Africa

Better Work (BW) is a joint partnership of the International Labour Organisation (ILO) and International Finance Corporation (IFC) with the aim of improving labour standards compliance in the global clothing industry without negatively impacting supplier competitiveness. It currently operates in eight countries, bringing together global buyers, local governments, employers and unions to engage in social dialogue around this aim. A 6-year study of BW Lesotho examined whether BW led to sustainable improvements in labour standards compliance. Data included 55 focus groups with 426 workers during four waves of data collection between 2011 and 2017. Findings indicated that improvements across a number of compliance areas were enabled by worker voice mechanisms established by BW Lesotho at the factory level. However, in the wake of BW's departure from Lesotho, conditions worsened.

This paper seeks to better understand the apparent lack of domestic regulatory capacity in Lesotho, and examine the possibilities for ensuring the sustained improvement of labour standards enforcement, along with the obstacles preventing this from happening. Through a pilot project on enforcing labour laws in Southern Africa, this paper aims to better understand the limitations and strengths of multi-stakeholder models in South Africa and Lesotho. The focus is on whether these models provide a better way to enforce labour rights. To investigate this question, fieldwork was carried out in the garment sectors in South Africa and Lesotho during 2018. This research involved interviews with stakeholders in both countries including government officials, employers, unions, NGOs and other local initiatives, and workers themselves.

INTRODUCTION

Okun's law establishes a stable negative relationship between changes in output and unemployment. Yet views are still divided on the existence of Okun's law, which naturally questions the current practice of using it for policy development. If relevant, the strength of the linkage between growth and employment (i.e. coefficients for Okun's law) tends to differ between countries, especially between developed and developing countries. In low income countries, the coefficient is often weak or positive, and even in developed countries, the variations between countries are sizable. The factors underlying these are not yet well understood. Many studies point to the role of "rigid" labour market institutions but the evidence to date has failed to provide support for this hypothesis.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The paper poses important policy related questions, including:

• Is Okun's law disappearing? Does it hold in developing countries? Does informality, economic structure and employment legislation have an impact on this coefficient?

• What are reliable (credible) ways of using Okun's law in different country circumstances?

• What definitions of "employment" should be used for policies to strengthen the jobs impacts of growth?

How should “full employment” be defined from these policy perspectives?

METHODOLOGY

Data: ILO data

• Key variables: GDP growth, unemployment, employment (2000-latest)

Growth and Employment: Revisiting Okun's Law and Full Employment

Sangheon Lee, Juan Chacaltana, Dorothea Schmidt-Klau, Johannes Weiss

ILO, Switzerland

INTRODUCTION

Okun’s law establishes a stable negative relationship between changes in output and unemployment. Yet views are still divided on the existence of Okun’s law, which naturally questions the current practice of using it for policy development. If relevant, the strength of the linkage between growth and employment (i.e. coefficients for Okun’s law) tends to differ between countries, especially between developed and developing countries. In low income countries, the coefficient is often weak or positive, and even in developed countries, the variations between countries are sizable. The factors underlying these are not yet well understood. Many studies point to the role of “rigid” labour market institutions but the evidence to date has failed to provide support for this hypothesis.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The paper poses important policy related questions, including:

• Is Okun's law disappearing? Does it hold in developing countries? Does informality, economic structure and employment legislation have an impact on this coefficient?

• What are reliable (credible) ways of using Okun’s law in different country circumstances?

• What definitions of “employment” should be used for policies to strengthen the jobs impacts of growth?

How should “full employment” be defined from these policy perspectives?

METHODOLOGY

Data: ILO data

• Key variables: GDP growth, unemployment, employment (2000-latest)
The main argument of the paper is that “legal institutionalism,” meaning a form of institutionalist economic thought attentive to the legal architecture of the economy, reveals more viable possibilities for significant redistribution of income through collective bargaining in the Global South than conventional economic approaches. This is especially true once we go beyond just the labor market and consider legal specialization in medium- or low-tech activities is likely to affect local capabilities for creating and scaling up complex technologies -rather than just adopting or using- without deepening polarization between advanced and emerging -or developing- economies as well as within them.

CONTRIBUTIONS TO LITERATURE AND FINDINGS

Even in advanced countries, studies report different coefficients in terms of magnitude, significance and stability. And only recently efforts have been made to extend analysis to developing countries (e.g. An et al 2017).

This paper tries to develop a global perspective which integrates varying situations in developing countries, taking full advantage of ILO’s new and global data sets, including economic and employment structure and institutions. The results of the analysis will have implications for the definition/scope of ‘employment’ (or more specifically, ‘full employment’) as a policy target for economic and labour market policy interventions.

Reshaping Global Production: Knowledge-Intensive Activities as Drivers of Structural Change in the Post-2008 Crisis

Marianela Sarabia

1Independent researcher, Argentine Republic; 2UADE, Argentine University of Enterprise

Focusing in the post-2008 crisis period, this article contributes, first, to analyse the missing link between the global trade slowdown and changes in global production by introducing the concept of global production system. Under this framework and according to recent studies, we identified changing growth patterns between developed and emerging economies as well as compensation effects in terms of job creation and redistribution of income through collective bargaining in the Global South than conventional economic thought attentive to the legal architecture of the economy, reveals more viable possibilities for significant redistribution of income through collective bargaining in the Global South than conventional economic approaches. This is especially true once we go beyond just the labor market and also consider legal institutionalist work on trade, which reveals that trade law can be configured in many different ways that contribute to a more comprehensive analysis for sustainable development.

Based on the latest, it is possible to suggest that there is an emerging accumulation pattern led by knowledge-intensive capabilities and its development, which, being mainly concentrated in advanced economies, seems to be behind on-going reconfiguration of the global production system. Based on world input-output tables from WIOD 2016 release, this article presents an empirical corroboration, suggesting how ICT diffusion and internet breakthrough have played in transforming services related to publishing, marketing and mass media. At the same time, analysing main trends among G7 and BRIC countries and global sectors within the global productive system allowed us not only to ‘take’ the broad pictures, but also make questions and elaborate new hypothesis to be tested within our analytical framework in further developments.

We conclude that developed economies have strengthened their specialization pattern in knowledge-intensive activities since early-2000s, whereas emerging economies have been growing in medium-tech and low-tech activities. Since these activities are related to a lower share of value added/gross output in comparison with the analogous coefficient for knowledge-intensive activities, current academic debate and global agenda should discuss issues related to international division of labour and its implications towards contributing to a more comprehensive analysis for sustainable development. In this sense, a key question for further research is how far specialization in medium- or low-tech activities is likely to affect local capabilities for creating and scaling up complex technologies -rather than just adopting or using- without deepening polarization between advanced and emerging -or developing- economies as well as within them.

Trade and Labor Through Legal Institutionalist Lens: Mapping Distribution and Growth in a Zero-Sum World

Pascal McDougall

Harvard Law School, USA

This paper engages with the literature on labor law in the Global South and reassesses the project of empowering southern workers through labor unions and/or a harmonization of labor laws at the global level. The paper asks what economic consequences a significant amount of redistribution from employers to employees through union-negotiated wages would be likely to have in developing countries.

The main argument of the paper is that “legal institutionalism,” meaning a form of institutionalist economic thought attentive to the legal architecture of the economy, reveals viable possibilities for significant redistribution of income through collective bargaining in the Global South than conventional economic approaches. This is especially true once we go beyond just the labor market and also consider legal institutionalist work on trade, which reveals that trade law can be configured in many different ways that distribute comparative advantage differently across the globe.

Since the level of wages sustainable for any given country is a function of how comparative advantage is distributed, the paper argues it is seldom beneficial to advocate for more union power in the south without
The Future of Shopping: Personal Consumption, Sustainable Development and Decent Work

Oliver Liang, Margherita Licata, David Kapya
ILO, Switzerland

Introduction

Shopping is a significant individual social and economic act which collectively has a critical impact on global employment and decent work. Evolving technology, such as e-commerce, artificial intelligence, and digitized logistics is disrupting existing business models - through on-demand production, self-check-outs, and same-day delivery - to satisfy the increasing demand for such items as clothing, electronics and food. Such business models have displaced jobs, and new jobs created in production, packaging, transport, storage and retail have been marked by polarization, low wages, and vulnerable employment. Furthermore, the environmental cost of the mass production and consumption of such items cannot be underestimated. The production of clothing, electronics and certain foods is resource costly and polluting, and much of this production is non-essential: of the 80 billion clothing items produced annually, for example, an estimated three-quarters end in a landfill after a short life-cycle.

Research questions

The proposed paper will try to answer the following questions:

• How are technology, demographic and environmental forces changing shopping behaviours, in particular, mass consumption, high-end shopping, and sustainable consumption?
• What are the decent work impacts of a transition from a business model of mass consumption towards a more sustainable consumption, including a growing sharing economy, circular economy and consumption of alternative products?
• What measures and policies would be needed to ensure that sustainable consumption efforts address inequalities associated with the new types of work and capture the employment potential of new consumer trends?

Methodology

The paper is based on a review of secondary data on employment, consumption and retail in clothing, electronic and food drawn from the ILO and other global reports and databases. The employment data will be analysed against household consumption, sector-specific and consumer data to map out the decent work dimensions of various shopping systems in different world regions.

Contribution to literature and findings

The current discussion of sustainable consumption and production focusses on the production side: how technological substitution through the use of green technology and renewable energies may change employment and skills development patterns. This paper will analyse the consumption side, looking at how changing consumer demand can affect jobs in the shopping economy, as well as their organization and quality. This will contribute to a more thorough debate around innovative measures and regulations needed to facilitate a just transition towards sustainable consumption.
reaching the most marginalized and finding a balance between promoting healthy lives and business gains.

It is crucial to amplify this issue particularly with the private sector. We must encourage global supply chain stakeholders to invest in primary health care to promote worker wellbeing and benefit from the business gains as a result.

This special session aims to amplify the case for prevention, promotion and primary care services for workers along with highlight the business gains from these investments to the key stakeholders of manufacturing and garment supply chain.

The panelists:
Global brand representative speaking on investments made in worker health and wellbeing and gains achieved.
Leading business network representative discussing the power of networking across supply chains to invest in healthcare
Academic from Tufts University providing evidence of business and health gains for workers from promoting worker wellbeing
WHO representation on the case for private sector investment in promotion, preventive and primary health within the workplace, in labour intensive industries.
Leader from Swasti with experience in worker wellbeing to reflect on workers’ needs and voices of workers pre and post health interventions.

Presentations of the Special Session

Gains From Investments Made in Worker Health and Wellbeing
Daniel Lee
Levi Strauss Foundation
For over 25 years, Levi Strauss & Co has been committed to conducting responsible supply chain management practices. In order to further this goal, the company has instituted Worker Wellbeing programs in 12 countries to invest in the health, financial security and gender equity of nearly 200,000 workers. By fostering a positive and productive relationship between the vendors, the workers and Levi Strauss & Co, Worker Wellbeing programs have resulted in both sustainable financial and social returns on investment. Some programs saw a 4:1 return on investment by lowering absenteeism, diminishing the turnover rate, reducing the number of injuries, accidents and clinic visits, lowering the tardy rate, and by increasing worker productivity and supply chain reliability. Levi’s, in collaboration with Sustainability and Health Initiative for NetPositive Enterprise (SHINE) at Harvard’s T.H. Chan School of Public Health, will begin using blockchain technology to further monitor the success of these programs.

Power of Networking to Enable Investments in Healthcare*
Lisa Staxang
Business For Social Responsibility
Supply chains have enormous power to positively impact human life. It can drive effective collaboration among business partners, and influence industry peers and the broader policy landscape to achieve health and wellbeing. Supply chain networks can effectively work towards providing affordable healthcare by promoting collaboration and partnerships with stakeholders.

BSR, works with about 400 organizations and partners to build a sustainable world. BSR has over 25 years of experience in designing, implementing, and scaling effective business-led collaborations. Increased collaboration is good for societies, who benefit from the collective reach, resources, and voice of businesses working for a common cause.

Collective reach is the need of the hour to address inadequacies in primary health care in supply chains and communities. Given this context, can collaboration and networking play a key role in in bringing together leaders to transform primary healthcare in supply chains?

Evidence of Business Gains and Health Gains for the Workers
Drusilla Brown
Tufts Labor Lab
Tufts Labor Lab undertook an impact evaluation of ‘Women in Factories’ program to measure the returns on investment on workers health and business. Fourteen factories in South Asia participated in the evaluation from 2014-2016, through a randomised controlled trial covering 1025 respondents from the Foundational training and 1150 respondents from the Advanced training cohorts on lifeskills.

15 hours of Foundational training improved productivity by 5% among women, and reduced late days from 45 per 100 workers to 17 per month, workforce turnover from 30-23 per 100 workers for a given period, reduced gender pay gap by USD 1.35 (40%). Training increased sense of pride in work, teamwork, problem solving.

80-100 hours of Advanced training reduced workforce turnover from 30 to 21 per 100 workers for a given period, absenteeism by 20%, late arrivals by 77% per month and increased workers’ capacity to meet production targets from 88% to 96%.
Workers' Needs and Voices of Workers Pre and Post Health Interventions
Shankar AG
Swasti Health Catalyst
Swasti works to improve lives of poor and marginalized worker communities in global supply chains. We have enriched the lives of over 200,000 workers, mostly women, across 200 factories and supported 11 countries with technical assistance, capacity building, program and policy design.

Workers face numerous health issues because health is not a priority which in turn affects productivity. Research indicates about 57% of women are Anaemic; 80% suffer from Asthma, 60% from musculoskeletal problems, 51% from vision problems, 37% from back pain, 16% from hearing loss and asthma, 14% face sexual abuse and 5% suffer from depression. Labour attrition rates of 20% to 30% with 67% sickness absenteeism leads to suboptimal business outcomes.

The Invest for Wellness (i4We) is a system innovation in primary healthcare, combining health and wealth interventions. The voices and unmet needs of workers, and the recent gains from a system innovation will be highlighted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4:00pm - 5:30pm</th>
<th>Plenary 3: Global Commission on the Future of Work: Work for a Brighter Future</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GB room (R3 south)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:30pm - 6:00pm</td>
<td>Closing ceremony and award of RDW Prize, with Guy Ryder (Director-General, ILO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB room (R3 south)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>